



Milan Urban Food Policy Pact Monitoring Framework

Draft version, July 2018

Indicator 36: Number of fresh fruit and vegetable outlets per 1000 inhabitants (markets and shops) supported by the municipality.

MUFPP framework of actions' category: Food supply and distribution

The indicator measures the number of food markets or retail outlets providing fresh fruit and vegetables per 1000 inhabitants that are directly supported by the municipality in some way.

Overview table

MUFPP Work stream	Food supply and distribution
MUFPP action	Provide policy and programme support for municipal public food markets including farmers markets, informal markets, retail and wholesale markets, restaurants, and other food distributors, recognizing different approaches by cities working with private and public components of market systems.
What the indicator measures	Number of food markets or retail outlets providing fresh fruit and vegetables per 1000 inhabitants that are directly supported by the municipality in some way.
Which variables need to be measured / what data are needed	Categories of shops by type and scale; categories of markets by type and scale; numbers of shops and markets per neighbourhood that sell fresh fruit and vegetables; total population figures by neighbourhood
Unit of measurement <i>(i.e. Percentages, averages, number, etc.)</i>	Number
Unit(s) of Analysis <i>(i.e. people under 5 years old, etc.)</i>	Number of fresh fruits and vegetables outlets per 1000 inhabitants; outlets supported by the municipality
Possible sources of information of such data	-Public food register or similar list held by food safety inspection team or Environmental Health Department(national or local government); -Economic Development Department; -City Markets Department; -Trader organisations or unions; Business Development partnerships; -Wholesale and retail consortia or representative bodies; -Greengrocer networks; -Local food activists; -Food governance body e.g. Food Policy Council, Public Health Department, -NGO's concerned with food access

Possible methods/tools for data-collection	Review of existing databases and reports; interviews with key stakeholders
Expertise required	Research, data analysis, interview design implementation and analysis, statistics
Resources required/ estimated costs	
Specific observations	There are several challenges with this indicator. 1) It may be too much to measure both shops and markets so figures on either would be a good place to start. 2) It may be difficult to separate out which ones the municipality does or does not support. 3) Scale of retail or market outlet will determine overall total numbers of customer to a large extent, so this scale context needs to be reflected in some way. 4) The indicator could be changed to look at floor space per capita (see below), or area of shelves dedicated to volumes of fresh fruit and vegetables (see data section below). 5) The final figures could be worked out simply as totals but without any additional context this would not be very useful. 6) Alternatively, this work could be done as an audit on a neighbourhood basis, initially targeting specific neighbourhoods of concern, and gathering more useful comparative data across all neighbourhoods. As always, contextual notes need to be available alongside any indicator figures. Work on this indicator should be done alongside work on indicator 37 ' <i>Annual municipal investment in food markets or retail outlets</i> '.
Examples of application	New York City measures amount of grocery store space per person - specifically calculated as the square footage of supermarket floor space per capita by community district (p20). http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/foodpolicy/downloads/pdf/2016-Food-Metrics-Report.pdf

Rationale/evidence

The overarching purpose of this area of work is to improve and optimise the functioning and infrastructure of food markets in the city. This indicator relates to the provision of supportive policy and programmes that enable public food markets to successfully operate. The final calculated indicator figure also needs additional contextual information to be meaningful.

Retail & local government: In most cities, food retail is organised and owned by private companies that provide food to residents through a range of different types of retail outlets. In relation to these outlets, the role of local government may be largely restricted to granting planning permission for use or change of premises, enforcing food safety regulations and dealing with business rates and rents.

Fresh food markets & local government: The area where the local government has more scope to influence food supply is with fresh food markets where market traders sell the products: covered or uncovered, traditional city centre or neighbourhood food retail markets, farmers markets, fresh produce markets, specialist product markets, street food markets etc. In this case the local government may grant trader licences, provide planning permissions for markets to take place, manage temporary street closures and provide practical market organising logistics including signage, provision of water and power and cleaning and waste disposal services. Each country will have their own particular arrangements that in term determine the role of the municipality.

Policy example: The UK All Party Parliamentary Markets Group (APPMG) set out, in their 2007 Markets Policy Framework document, why "successful markets matter in all their forms." For the APPMG, "they contribute to the social, environmental and economic well-being of the nation" by:

- Providing a sense of place
- Being part of the nation's cultural tradition.
- Remaining an important element of the economy, particularly in relation to independent

- retailing, local employment and business start-up opportunities.
- Offering local access to fresh produce and other commodities.
- Reducing environmental impacts e.g. by eliminating excessive packaging/waste.¹

(See references section for more on the benefits of these markets and why local governments should support them.)

Glossary/concepts/definitions used

‘Supported by the municipality’: As outlined above, most municipalities will have some kind of statutory regulatory and financial relationship with retail and market outlets, but this may not be regarded as ‘support’. Support could be understood as a particular intervention to enable, maintain, or increase accessibility and availability of fresh fruit and vegetables in the city. For retail outlets this could be support for community-run shops where premises may be offered at low or no rent; permission to run ‘pop-up’ shops in temporarily empty premises; exemptions or low rates for fruit and vegetable businesses based in low income areas or neighbourhoods classed as ‘food deserts’. In general supermarkets are owned by large companies and don’t need the support of the municipality, but sometimes residents may request supermarkets in areas where the food retail offer is poor. In which case the municipality might do more than usual to enable formal planning permissions or leases, etc. For markets the support provided by the municipality may be more obvious. Some examples can be found above (see Rationale/Evidence). A municipality might change local laws to allow markets to take place, or provide training for all market traders in food safety etc. Criteria for what ‘supported by the municipality’ means will need to be agreed by each city as appropriate.

Retail outlets by type: Each city will have its own particular food retail typology (see also guidance notes for indicator 21 *Number of jobs related to the food sector*). An adapted and locally relevant food retail typology needs to be developed and used to guide data collection and analysis. For example, within food retail a range of types can be distinguished: supermarkets, smaller grocery stores, specialist food retailers (e.g. bakers, butchers, and fish sellers), kiosks, market vendors, etc. The retail outlets that sell fresh fruit and vegetables then need to be identified ideally also by location. It will also be important to note scale of the retail outlet as part of the context, even though the indicator calculation cannot show this.

Community-led retail: In addition to other examples already given, there may also be municipal support in the form of start-up grants for particular types of food retail enterprise like farmers markets or community supported agriculture or urban market gardens or food cooperatives or community shops. These types of retail outlets should be included.

Market outlets by type: As with retail outlets, each city will have its own particular market typology. This needs to be identified and used to guide data collection and analysis. There are some examples of different types of markets above (see Rationale/Evidence). The market outlets that sell fresh fruit and vegetables then need to be identified, ideally also by location and scale.

Preparations

The team responsible for monitoring this indicator should agree on:

1. Criteria for what ‘supported by the municipality’ means (e.g. include supermarkets or not – according to criteria). This may need to be done in consultation with relevant officers in the municipality, or by speaking to retail and market managers.

¹ House of Commons paper: Can the traditional market survive? Communities and Local Government Committee, UK Parliament
<https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm200809/cmselect/cmcomloc/308/30806.htm>

2. Which outlets to include (identify which outlets sell fresh fruit and vegetables)
3. Type of data disaggregation and categories that will be used (see further below)
4. How to address the location and scale issues, in relation to calculating a final figure (see further below)
5. How to relate numbers of outlets to 1000 inhabitants – use overall totals for the city or provide more detailed analysis by neighbourhood
6. Data collection method (analysis of records and/or stakeholder interviews)
7. Key stakeholders to interview if there are gaps in the data
8. If interviews are to be used, questions have to be designed. Training of interviewers may be needed.

Sampling

N/A. The purpose of interviews would be to identify data on outlets and to gain more understanding of the nature of municipal support.

Data collection and data disaggregation

Sources of data: See above table for possible sources of data. Most municipalities will have records of food outlets. If none exist or if there are clear gaps in the data, then the best way to do this audit is to begin with the most known and well used types of fruit and vegetable outlets or to focus on one neighbourhood at a time. A simple random street survey/rapid appraisal could be done to find out where people buy their fruit and vegetables in each neighbourhood. While the resulting figures on numbers of outlets may not be accurate, they would provide some indication of provision. A follow up discussion with the municipality would clarify to some extent the nature and levels of its support for those outlets.

Selection of outlets to include in the final calculation

- Identify which types of retail and market outlets sell fresh fruit & vegetables
- Identify which of retail and market outlets to count (this could be all, and then separate out those 'supported by the municipality'; the whole picture will also be very useful information for other indicators).

Categorise by type (and subtype if necessary)

- Supermarkets
- Shops – type of shop (e.g. specialist shops; fruits and vegetable shops, mixed grocery)
- Fresh food markets – type of market (e.g. specialist shops; fruits and vegetable shops, mixed grocery)
- Note specific support provided by municipality

Categorise by scale: Agree criteria for shops (classification may already exist). For markets, one option may be to record the number of fruit & veg traders at each market. This is important contextual information especially if figures are calculated for each neighbourhood. For a final calculation it would be simplest to use total numbers of outlets in relation to the total number of inhabitants. However this figure will not be very useful on its own, as it will not show geographical disparities and the scale of fruit and vegetable provision will not be considered. For example there would be no distinction between a small shop and a large specialist fruit and vegetable market, but they will serve very different numbers of people.

Number of outlets per 1000 inhabitants: If this is done on a neighbourhood basis, the figures will be much more meaningful. This could focus initially on the most vulnerable neighbourhoods and be build up in relation to available resources and policy priorities.

Data analysis/calculation of the indicator

The indicator is computed by calculating the total number of fresh fruit and vegetable outlets that are supported by the municipality, per 1000 inhabitants. However, as noted this number on its own is not very useful. An audit of provision that sets out localised information on a neighbourhood basis would be much more useful.

There are a number of additional contextual figures that could be gathered while doing this work. For example:

- Numbers of specialist i) fresh fruit and vegetable shops; ii) markets per neighbourhood
- Number of fruit and vegetable sellers in each market; & % of traders selling fruit & vegetables in each market
- Type of municipal support already provided or needed in the future
- Neighbourhoods with the highest/lowest per capita provision of fresh fruit and vegetables

Data could be visually presented on maps or tables that distinguish neighbourhood data sets.

Note: Another measure could be to specifically calculate the total retail area of floor space or shelves dedicated to total volumes of fresh fruit and vegetables in each neighbourhood/per capita. The way this is normally calculated takes into account rotation of product. In many Municipal outlets the rotation may be 10-15 Tons per sq. metre, however, in more informal markets it may go up to 60 Tons/sq. metre. Based on a comment by Jorge Fonseca. Please add FAO references/reports.

References and links to reports/tools

The case for supporting markets in urban areas

House of Commons paper: Can the traditional market survive?

Communities and Local Government Committee, UK Parliament

<https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm200809/cmselect/cmcomloc/308/30806.htm>

This paper sets out a wide range of benefits that traditional retail markets and farmers markets can bring to local towns and communities and whether they are sufficiently important to warrant greater attention [and therefore support] from local authorities and central government.

Communities and Local Government Committee Select Committee Inquiry into Traditional Retail Markets; National Farmers' Retail and Markets Association (FARMA), UK

<https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm200809/cmselect/cmcomloc/memo/tradrema/ucm2702.pdf>

New York City data collection on grocery store space per person

The City of New York measures amount of grocery store space per person - specifically calculated as the square footage of supermarket floor space per capita by community district (p20).

<http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/foodpolicy/downloads/pdf/2016-Food-Metrics-Report.pdf>

Market promotion and international campaign

At an international level, the 'Love Your Local Market' campaign, which began in the UK in 2012 with 400 markets, has developed into an international movement spanning 17 countries, with over 3000 markets participating across the globe in 2017. The global 'Love Your Local Market' (LYLM) campaign is an annual event celebrating wholesale & retail (street or covered) markets. It is held in the month of May, now known as the Month of Markets! LYLM Global is supported & coordinated by the World Union of Wholesale Markets (WUWM) since 2014.

World union of wholesale markets: promoting wholesale and retail markets worldwide
<http://www.wuwm.org/7mr/home/lylm.html>

Food retail assessment and mapping

Who Feeds Bristol: towards a resilient food plan, Carey, 2011 (Section 5, Retail, pp24-26). Data for the mapping in this report was collected by the researcher using databases held by the Environmental Health/Food Safety Inspection team, and turned into maps using GIS technology by the Public Health Department. <http://bristolfoodpolicycouncil.org/who-feeds-bristol/>