



## Milan Urban Food Policy Pact Monitoring Framework

Draft version, July 2018

**Indicator 32:** Proportion of local/regional food producers that sell their products to public markets in the city

### MUFPP framework of actions' category: Food production

*The indicator monitors the share of local/regional food producers that sell (part of) their products to one or more public market outlets in the city*

#### Overview table

<b>MUFPP Work stream</b>	<b>Food production</b>
<b>MUFPP action</b>	<b>Support short food chains</b> , producer organisations, producer-to-consumer networks and platforms, and other market systems that integrate the social and economic infrastructure of urban food system that links urban and rural areas. This could include civil society-led social and solidarity economy initiatives and alternative market systems.
<b>What the indicator measures</b>	The indicator monitors the share of local/regional food producers that sell (part of) their products to one or more public market outlets in the city.  <i>Note 1: The focus is first on public markets for ease of data collection. If information is available, other –private- market outlets could be included in the indicator.</i>  <i>Note 2: If data are available, an additional and complementary indicator could measure the “Percentage of local/regional food that is sold to public markets in the city”. It is expected however that data needed for this indicator are not readily available.</i>
<b>Which variables need to be measured / what data are needed</b>	-Total number of local/regional food producers -Total number of food producers that sell their products in public markets in the city. If desired: type of food producers; type and location of market outlets
<b>Unit of measurement</b> <i>(i.e. Percentages, averages, number, etc.)</i>	Proportion/percentage of local/regional food producers selling their produce in public markets in the city
<b>Unit(s) of Analysis</b> <i>(i.e. people under 5 years old, etc.)</i>	Data can be disaggregated by type of food producers (share of men/ women; youth/adults; other socio-economic categories) and by market outlet (municipal markets, supermarkets, groceries, institutional procurement, consumer boxes)

<b>Possible sources of information of such data</b>	-Economic/market government department -Agriculture department/programmes -Different market stores/locations -Earlier research
<b>Possible methods/tools for data-collection</b>	-Market survey -Food producers survey
<b>Expertise required</b>	Survey design and implementation
<b>Resources required/ estimated costs</b>	
<b>Specific observations</b>	It is acknowledged that data from private sector markets are very hard to get and that data on product location (local products vs non-local products) may not be readily available.  It is also noted that in cities in the Global South, informal markets (street food, home restaurants) count for an important part of sales of locally produced food. Data collection from the informal sector may be too difficult/time consuming or unreliable. Rather more anecdotal evidence/case studies may be used or findings from earlier research.
<b>Examples of application</b>	The Consuming Urban Poverty project implemented market surveys, including product sourcing, in Kitwe (Zambia), Kisumu (Kenya) and Epworth (Zimbabwe). See: <a href="https://consumingurbanpoverty.wordpress.com/">https://consumingurbanpoverty.wordpress.com/</a>

## Rationale/evidence

Short food supply chains are promoted to harnesses more integrated urban-rural relations, strengthen social relations between consumer and producers, and promote the inclusiveness of smallholder farmers and vulnerable groups across the supply chain.

The government of Belo Horizonte Metropolitan Region has recognised that small family farms in the urban, peri-urban and rural areas of the metropolitan region are an important component of a healthy, sustainable urban food system, and hence an important contributor to the welfare of urban residents on the long term. Throughout the years, the local government has shown how it can support the interests of the urban population, while at the same time enhancing the livelihoods of food producers and the sustainability of agricultural production. Strategies used include:

1. Provision of a direct market outlet for food producers (“Straight from the Farm programme” and the “Country Store Programme”; conventional and organic markets)
2. Through institutional food purchase/direct procurement of supply from urban, peri-urban and rural producers<sup>1</sup>.

The Municipality of Milan also approaches the building of a local food system from both the point of view of the consumer (Food Policy, Priority n° 1: Guaranteeing healthy food for everybody; Guideline n°1.2: The Municipality shall ensure that in each district of the city affordable, healthy and sustainable food is available within short distances that can be covered by people with restricted mobility) as well as the producer (Priority n°2: Promote the sustainability of the food system; Guideline n°2.3: The Municipality shall support social, technological and organisational innovation in processing,

<sup>1</sup> Marielle Dubbeling, Stephania Aleixo de Paula e Silva, Marcelo Lana Franco and Adilana de Oliveira Rocha Alcântara (2016). Rural Food Supply for Vulnerable Urban Groups In: Dubbeling M., C. Bucatariu, G. Santini, C. Vogt and K. Eisenbeiß (2016). City Region Food Systems and Food Waste Management Linking Urban and Rural Areas for Sustainable and Resilient Development. Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit / GIZ, RUAF Foundation, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations / FAO. Available from <http://www.ruaf.org/publications/city-region-food-systems-and-food-waste-management-2016> and <http://www.fao.org/3/a-i6233e.pdf>.

distribution, logistics and trading activities to facilitate the transition to a sustainable food system). In Milan, there are currently 10 farmers markets on public areas. The municipality is working on a municipal regulation, which will firmly acknowledge the presence of short-chain markets in the city and the areas where they are held (personal communication City of Milan).

### Glossary/concepts/definitions used

**Local/regional food producers:** Local/regional producers are those producers growing/cultivating/producing in a given city region. Building from a tradition of regional economic geography studies, we know that city regions provide a critical lens through which to understand sub-national dynamics and link economic activity to space. While a city region approach may not address all cases—for example, specific contexts such as small island states where, in some cases, there are no defined city territories but rather urban area territories, the city region has also been used to understand more about resource flows to minimise environmental impacts by, for example, understanding and closing waste through more efficient resource use.<sup>2</sup> A city region is defined here as: “as larger urban centre or conglomeration of smaller urban centres and the surrounding and interspersed peri-urban and rural hinterland”. Although contexts differ across cities and regions, such urban-rural partnerships and inter-municipal cooperation always extend beyond traditional administrative boundaries.<sup>3</sup>

A first key activity here will be to conduct a participatory mapping exercise with a wide range of stakeholders to define the nature and boundaries of the local city region and to define “local/regional producers”. A city region can be defined using various criteria: main sources of food and food flows, natural boundaries, administrative and jurisdictional boundaries.

**Short food supply chains (SFSCs)** are characterised by shorter links between producers and consumers so that food relations are re-socialised and re-spatialised. SFSCs emerged and are defined in opposition to the conventional, industrial (long chain) food system as to include food values, food quality and preferences for example, local and/or organic food, often referring to provenance, the distance food travels and/or knowledge about the food and its region. The consideration is that producer-consumer relations are 'shortened' and redefined by communicating about the origin and quality attributes of food so that products reach the consumer with such information. In SFSCs, “the foods involved are identified by, and traceable to a farmer.”<sup>4</sup>

FAO considers that Short Food Supply Chains (SFSCs) have potential to improve farm incomes, promote sustainable farming systems and contribute to local economic development. There are many different forms of SFSC, but they share a common characteristic of reduced numbers of intermediaries between the farmer or food producer, and the consumer. Whilst the number of SFSCs has proliferated, their collective impact is limited by a number of barriers to scaling up.<sup>5</sup>

The focus in this indicator is on the origin of production (local/regional producers) and the location of sale (public markets in the city). The focus is first on public markets for ease of data collection. If information is available also other –private- market outlets could be included in the indicator. Examples of different **market outlets in the city** include publicly supported street, farmer or other food markets, institutional outlets (procurement), conventional markets such as supermarkets or grocery

---

<sup>2</sup> Blay Palmer A., G. Santini, M. Dubbeling, H. Renting, M. Taguchi and T. Giordano, 2017. Validating the City-Region Food System Approach: Enacting inclusive, transformational city-region food systems . Submitted for publication.

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.fao.org/in-action/food-for-cities-programme/toolkit/introduction/en/>;  
<http://www.ruaf.org/projects/developing-tools-mapping-and-assessing-sustainable-city-region-food-systems-cityfoodtools>

<sup>4</sup> See footnote 2

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.fao.org/family-farming/detail/en/c/410251/>. See also: Approximation to short food value chains in developing world: a case from Mexico City <http://www.fao.org/3/a-i6511e.pdf>

stores, or other direct-to-consumers markets such on-farm stores, or food boxes.

**Public markets.** According to [Wikipedia](#), a market, or marketplace, is a location where people regularly gather for the purchase and sale of provisions, livestock, and other goods. But to be considered a *public* market, the market must:

-Have public goals: how does this place contribute to the community?

-Operate in public spaces- it can be privately owned but customers should not pay to get in

-Serve locally owned and operated businesses. Research from the Ford Foundation shows public markets confer multiple benefits to the communities they serve.<sup>6</sup>

## Preparations

The team responsible for monitoring this indicator should agree on:

1. Type of data disaggregation and categories that will be used (see further below)
2. Data collection method (market and/or food producer survey)
3. If surveys are to be used, information should be collected first on the total number of food producers and market outlets (for sampling purposes) and a survey instrument has to be designed. Training of survey enumerators may be needed.

## Sampling

In general, a 10% sample (10% of all food producers; 10% of all or specific market outlets) will provide sufficiently reliable data.

Depending on policy or monitoring priorities, surveys could be implemented among specific groups of producers (e.g. youth, women, small-scale producers, etc.), among specific market outlets or in specific areas of the city.

## Data collection and data disaggregation

Data disaggregation can be done by 1/ Type of food producer and 2/ Type and location of market outlet.

### 1. Type of food producers (and their organisations)

Indicate the different types and numbers of food producers:

- Youth vs. adult producers
- Men vs. women producers
- Small scale, vs. medium-scale or large scale producers
- Type of farming systems
- Any other category (e.g. community gardeners with license to sell vs. commercial producers, etc.).

### 2. Type and location of market outlet

This indicator can be disaggregated for different market types e.g. farmers markets, public markets, public sector food procurement, supermarkets, grocery or specialty stores, wholesale markets, street food vendors, direct to consumer markets (such as box schemes, on-farm sales), private retail and catering, etc. Collecting additional information on the spatial location of different market outlets will provide data for other indicators such as food deserts (Indicator 8 *Number of households living in “food deserts”*).

---

<sup>6</sup> <https://www.pps.org/article/4-guidelines-on-taking-public-markets-to-the-next-level>

Note: If data are available, an additional and complementary indicator could measure the “Percentage of local/regional food that is sold to public markets in the city”. To do so data need to be collected on:

- Total volume of local/regional produced food
- Total volume of local/regional food sold in (public) markets.

It is expected however that data needed for this indicator are not readily available.

Data can be collected from:

### **1. Market surveys**

Surveys among specific or all types of market outlets in the city to monitor current sale of locally produced food items and identify obstacles and opportunities for improvement.

### **2. Food producer surveys**

In addition to, or in place of, a market survey, a survey among a sample of urban and peri-urban food producers would yield the needed information. This survey could integrate questions that would also provide data for other indicators, like land ownership and tenure regimes (see indicator 28 *Proportion of total agricultural population with ownership or secure rights over agricultural land for food production, by sex*), area under sustainable agriculture (Indicator 29 *Proportion of agricultural land in the municipal area under sustainable agriculture*) and number of producers that benefitted from technical training and assistance (Indicator 30 *Number of food producers that benefitted from technical training and assistance in the past 12 months*).

Sample questions from surveys developed for other (African research) projects are provided in Annex 1 and 2<sup>7</sup>.

## Data analysis/calculation of the indicator

The indicator is computed by dividing the total number of food producers selling their products to markets in the city by the total number of local/regional food producers:

$$\text{Proportion of local/regional food producers that sell their products to public markets in the city} = (\text{Total number of food producers selling their products to markets in the city} / \text{Total number of local/regional food producers}) * 100$$

If data are available, the following alternative indicator can be computed:

$$\text{Volume of local/regional food products sold at markets in the city} / \text{Total volume of food products sold at markets in the city} * 100$$

Depending on the type of survey questions used, further analysis of information on for example consumer interest in local food, availability and prices of local food, incentives and needs for increased local sales can be implemented.

---

<sup>7</sup> Adapted from the Consuming Urban Poverty project: <https://consumingurbanpoverty.wordpress.com/>; World Bank urban food business survey

## Annex 1: Market Survey

### 1. Classify different type of market outlets

**[Only for wholesale and distribution]** If your business assembles and redistribute food items, what type of wholesale and distributor are you?

- Sale/redistribution to retailers
- Sale/redistribution to food caterers
- Sale/redistribution to others (*please specify*) .....
- We are also engaged in food retail
- Other (*specify*) .....
- Information does not exist
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

**[Only for retail]** If your business is a shop that sells food to the public, what type of retailer is it? *Only read the question out loud and select the most appropriate answers. Probe the interviewee further if no answers are forthcoming.*

- Supermarkets
- Kiosks/house shops
- Independent specialist stores (e.g. butchers, bakers, fishmongers etc.)
- Specific ethnic food shops (Polish, Somali, Asian etc.)
- Other shops (*please specify*) .....
- Food markets
- Processors & manufacturers that combine processing and retail (e.g. local millers)
- Wholesalers & distributors that are also engaged in retail
- Restaurants, hotels, cafes, other eating out places
- Informal street food sellers/ mobile vendors
- Direct sales from producers (e.g. farmers, urban gardens)
- Social/solidarity shop
- Community buying groups or cooperatives
- Other retail (*specify*).....
- Information does not exist
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

**[Only for catering, meals preparation]** If your business provides prepared food or meals, what sort of caterer is it? *Only read the question out loud and select the most appropriate answers. Probe the interviewee further if no answers are forthcoming.*

- Hotel, restaurant, café
- Catering company supplying other businesses
- School meal preparation
- Hospital meal preparation
- Private company meal preparation
- Own business preparing meals for sale
- Fast food outlet
- Kiosk serving food
- Permanent street food seller
- Mobile street food seller/hawker
- Other informal pre-prepared food sellers (e.g. office to office lunch sellers)
- Homeless or malnutrition or children feeding centres
- Other (*specify*).....

- Information does not exist
- Do not know/No response

**2. Location**

*Note: Please use a map to which the respondents can relate*

Where, in relation to the city boundaries, is your business located?

- Inner city area
- Outskirts of city but within municipal boundary
- Outside the city municipal boundary
- Another part of the city (*specify*).....

In which type of neighbourhood of the city is your business or your main business operation located? *Cross-check answer given with own observation by interviewer*

- Designated industrial area (in the city)
- Designated retail shopping mall (in the city)
- City provided retail space (e.g. market) in industrial areas
- Non official retail space (e.g. market areas) in residential areas
- Non official retail space (e.g. market areas) in industrial areas
- Mobile, move around locations
- Have more than one main site (*tick any other options as relevant*)
- In residential area, home-based
- Other (*specify*).....
- Information does not exist
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

**3. Sale of local food** (e.g. food produced by urban, peri-urban and rural producers in the municipal area)

Do you market or label your products as “local”?

- Yes
- No
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Where does your business buy ‘local’ products?

- Do not buy local products
- Directly from local farmers
- From wholesalers
- From other retail outlets
- Other (*specify*) .....
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

From how many local farmers or growers do you buy produce directly?

- Less than 5
- 5-10
- 10-25
- 25-50
- 50-100
- Over 100
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Which types of local products do you buy and sell? *Circle or add specific product details as appropriate*

- Fruits
- Vegetables – roots, tubers (potato, sweet potato, cassava)
- Other vegetables
- Meat
- Bread, cereals & grains (e.g. rice, millet, maize etc.)
- Eggs
- Fish & shellfish (fresh or dried)
- Dairy products (dried milk, liquid milk, cheese, yoghurt, curds, etc.)
- Pulses, seeds & nuts (or foods made with these ingredients)
- Sugars & sweeteners (e.g. honey, syrups)
- Fats & oils
- Processed items (e.g. noodles, biscuits, cakes, snacks/fritters)
- Mushrooms
- Other (*specify*).....
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

How easy is it for your business to get local products?

- Always easy
- Sometimes easy sometimes difficult
- Always difficult
- Impossible
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Do you stock any products that have a specific 'local food' label?

- Yes
- No
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

*If yes, specify what types of products*

How important is it to your business to inform your customers of where the food they buy comes from?

- Very important
- Quite important
- Not important
- Has not occurred to us to do that
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Is there a drive or a directive from the national or regional government to support more local supply chains/ promote domestic production/restrict imports?

- Yes, promote domestic production
- Yes, restrict imports
- Yes, support local supply chains
- No
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

If yes, what kinds of incentives are provided for businesses to work more with local products & supply chains?

- Financial incentives (*please specify*).....
- Technical support
- Marketing support & promotion
- Knowledge and information provision
- Other (*specify*) .....
- Don't know of any such incentives
- Choose not to response

#### 4. Total value of local produce

If your customers specifically request local products, which types of products do they request most? *Only read the question out loud and select the most appropriate answers. Probe the interviewee further if no answers are forthcoming.*

- Fruits (*specify which types*) .....
- Vegetables (*specify which types*) .....
- Meat (*specify which types*) .....
- Bread, cereals & grains (*specify which types*) .....
- Eggs
- Fish & shellfish (*specify which types*) .....
- Dairy products (*specify which types*) .....
- Pulses, seeds & nuts (*specify which types*) .....
- Sugars & sweeteners (*specify which types*) .....
- Fats & oils (*specify which types*) .....
- Mushrooms
- Other (*specify*) .....
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Are local products cheaper or more expensive than non-local products?

- Yes local products are cheaper
- No, both are the same
- No local products are more expensive
- Other (*specify*) .....
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Of your total food sales per year, what proportion is from local products?

- 0-25%
- 25-50%
- 50-75%
- 75-100%
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Would it be possible for your business to substitute more local products for imported products?

- Yes
- No
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

What prevents your business from selling/using more local products? *Only read the question out loud and select the most appropriate answers. Probe the interviewee further if no answers are forthcoming.*

- Cannot afford local products, prices too high

- No knowledge of what local products are available
- Range of types of local products too limited
- Volume of available local products too low
- No logistical means of getting local products
- No or low customer demand
- Customers prefer “imported products” because of their better quality or taste
- No funding or possibilities for marketing of local products/local product visibility
- Other (*specify*) .....
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

What is needed to facilitate/improve local supply food chains? *Only read the question out loud and select the most appropriate answers. Probe the interviewee further if no answers are forthcoming.*

- New/improved information and knowledge on local products/supply chains
- Improved coordination/collaboration among producers to pool local supply
- Improving quality of local production
- New/improved infrastructure (e.g. roads, centralised food distribution hubs)
- Training and technical assistance
- New/improved connections between various actors in the local supply chain
- Product labelling
- Policy or financial incentives
- Other (*specify*) .....
- Do not know

## Annex 2: Food producer survey<sup>8</sup>

Do you market or label your products as “local”?

- Yes
- No
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Which types of products do you sell at different markets in the city? *Circle or add specific product details as appropriate*

- Fruits
- Vegetables – roots, tubers (potato, sweet potato, cassava)
- Other vegetables
- Meat (please specify)
- Cereals & grains (e.g. rice, millet, maize etc.)
- Eggs
- Fish & shellfish (fresh or dried)
- Dairy products (dried milk, liquid milk, cheese, yoghurt, curds, etc.)
- Pulses, seeds & nuts (or foods made with these ingredients)
- Processed items (e.g. noodles, biscuits, cakes, snacks/fritters)
- Mushrooms
- Other (*specify*).....
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

Where do you sell your products locally?

---

<sup>8</sup> See footnote 2

- We do not sell our products on any market in the city
- Household deliveries/drop off to collection points
- Bulk-buying groups or co-ops
- On-farm sales
- Street markets or Farmers markets
- Whole sale markets
- Public offices or institutions (hospitals, government offices, schools)
- Supermarkets
- Grocery or speciality stores (*specify*).....
- Private catering (*restaurants, etc., specify*).....
- Other
- Do not know
- Choose not to response

What is needed to support you to sell a larger share of your products on markets in the city *Only read the question out loud and select the most appropriate answers. Probe the interviewee further if no answers are forthcoming.*

- New/improved information and knowledge (*specify*).....
- Improved coordination/collaboration among producers to pool local supply
- Improving quality of local production
- New/improved infrastructure (e.g. roads, centralised food distribution hubs)
- Training and technical assistance (*specify*).....
- New/improved connections between various actors in the local supply chain
- Product labelling
- Policy or financial incentives
- Other (*specify*) .....
- Do not know